



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

*L'Esprit de Renan*, by PIERRE GUILLOUX. Paris: J. de Gigord, 1921. 412 pp.

*Ernest Renan*, by LEWIS FREEMAN MOTT. New York: Appleton, 1921. vi + 462 pp.

*Ernest Renan, der Dichter und der Künstler*, by WALTHER KÜCHLER. Gotha: 1921. 213 pp.

Altho the centennial of Renan's birth has passed almost unnoticed, three recently published works point to the fact that an interest in the author of *la Vie de Jésus* and in his influence has not entirely disappeared. In *l'Esprit de Renan* Pierre Guilloux, with the *imprimatur* of the Church, renews the attack upon "cet écrivain si ensorcelant et si disputé," upon the founder of that pernicious Renanism or Dilettantism, upon the renegade from Saint-Sulpice who is recognized with Bayle and Voltaire as "l'un des adversaires les plus acharnés et les plus perfides du christianisme." The malicious sophistry of Guilloux and his bitter, controversial tone recall Biré and Parigot. The student of Renan might well ignore, of course, *l'Esprit de Renan*, were it not that the spirit and the influence of this *prêtre manqué* seem to his old adversaries so persistent and so powerful thirty years after his death. Guilloux finds consolation, however, in regarding *le Voyage du Centurion*, by Renan's grand-son, as an expiation for *les Origines du Christianisme*.

Professor L. F. Mott's recent biography of Renan supersedes all previous works in English. First of all, Mott has made excellent use of the large amount of new material which the earlier biographers did not have at their disposal. The publication of *Cahiers de Jeunesse*, *Nouveaux Cahiers de Jeunesse*, and *Fragments intimes et romanesques*, has given us a clearer comprehension not only of *Souvenirs d'Enfance et de Jeunesse* but of much of Renan's earlier work, especially *l'Avenir de la Science*. Secondly, a temporal and geographical remoteness has enabled Mott to attain much greater impartiality than his predecessors. Both Mary Robinson and Grant Duff have written of Renan in the somewhat indulgent and reminiscent mood of personal friends, while William Barry saw in Renan not much more than a striking contrast to Newman, whose conversion so providentially occurred almost contemporaneously with Renan's withdrawal from the

Church. Parigot's enmity seemed almost personal and even Séailles found it difficult to do full justice to Renan.

"It has not been the purpose of this study to defend Renan or even to propagate any of his ideas . . . but to exhibit the intimate relationship of his work to his life." In carrying out this purpose Mott has quite rightly laid more stress than his predecessors upon the importance of *l'Avenir de la Science* in which he finds all that is fundamental in Renan. He has shown in a very satisfactory manner the identity of thought and point of view in the *Notebooks* and *l'Avenir de la Science*. He sees in Renan, not what so many have pointed out, an accumulation of incongruities and contradictions, but rather "the unity of a fine life."

Mott has not, however, found anything really new to add to our knowledge or comprehension of the author of *Souvenirs d'Enfance et de Jeunesse*, which work still stands, as far as essentials are concerned, the best of the biographies of Renan. He has with great care and patience added the details, especially those concerning minor and unimportant events, but has not assisted us in that broader study of the intellectual and philosophic background and environment of the friend of Taine and Berthelot. He has placed too little emphasis upon the various French influences which were exerted upon Renan and has minimized the importance of Herder and Hegel.

He abuses the privilege of quotation. While one may agree with Anatole France that "les citations bien prises" constitute in many cases an adequate criticism, one questions the wisdom of such extensive citation. As Mott states, Renan is inexhaustibly rich in *obiter dicta*, but that hardly justifies so many pages of random quotation, which even in Mott's excellent translation lose much of their original flavor. He inadvertently ascribes to La Rochefoucauld rather than to Montesquieu the remark about never having had a "chagrin qu'une heure de lecture ne m'ait ôté."

In *Ernest Renan, der Dichter und der Künstler*, Professor Walther Küchler has given us an interesting study of Renan, whom he considers "die blendendste Erscheinung unter den französischen Schriftstellern der zweiten Hälfte des neunzehnten Jahrhunderts." He has paid special attention to the poetic and artistic aspirations of the young Renan, the Renan of the *Fragments intimes et romanesques*. The poet whom we all have within us

but who dies young, according to Sainte-Beuve, lived on with Renan in the scholar and the historian. The enthusiastic young student of the *Notebooks* was also trying his hand at verse, which we find in the *Fragments*, and attempting a novel in *Patrice*. It was the poet who wrote the descriptions in *la Vie de Jésus* and, if, in later life, the poetic faculties were somewhat dormant during the work on the *Corpus inscriptionum semiticarum*, they reappear again in full vigor in what Matthew Arnold with true Anglo-Saxon indignation denounced as a "monument of lubricity," *l'Abbesse de Jouarre*. Kùchler's analysis of his genuinely poetic and artistic nature must be considered as a real contribution to the study of Renan. While he has not had the advantage of any new material, he has made full use of what other scholars have also possessed and has succeeded in throwing new light upon the character and nature of Renan. It is quite possible that the latter's manuscripts and literary papers, deposited at the Bibliothèque Nationale, may, when they become accessible to the public, furnish Kùchler with much more material.

Certain of his chapters deserve special mention. He has, for example, given us a most intelligent and detailed discussion of Renan's early studies in German, especially his reading in German literature, and has also carefully reviewed Renan's later attitude toward German thought in general. He has shown us the effect of Italy upon Renan at the time of his first visit; altho Rome meant something quite different to Goethe, yet in the case of both Goethe and Renan there occurred a profound change under the influence of Italy. The judgments of the younger Renan on French literature in general have been analysed with the skill and discernment of one who has his subject well in hand. One cannot but regret that Kùchler has been unable, as he states in his preface, to continue his study of Renan in a second volume, which would have dealt with the influence of Renan upon contemporary thought.

The more important portions of his volume have already appeared in a slightly different form in *Die Neueren Sprachen* and *Zeitschrift für französische Sprache und Literatur*. The chapters added to the original articles possess much less value and in some cases show signs of too much haste in preparation. Both Mme Duclaux and "René d'Ys" should have prevented Kùchler from falling into the error of the *Souvenirs* as to the date of Renan's

birth and a verification of the quotation in the preface to *Le Prêtre de Nêmi* would have avoided the reference to Strabo as a "lateinischer Historiker."

The book is now published in a series entitled "Brücken" and unquestionably Renan has given us the safest 'bridge' with the most secure foundations for the mutual understanding of France and Germany. Renan, however, exhibited far more discrimination and critical acumen than did the author of *De l'Allemagne* and Kùchler should not have passed over in silence Gabriel Brunet's article (*Mercur de France*, 1er août, 1919), entitled *Renan et l'Allemagne*, where a slightly different emphasis is placed upon the question. The truth, of course, lies, as Renan so often said, somewhere between the positive and the negative and so in this case somewhere between Kùchler and Brunet.

JAMES F. MASON.

*Cornell University.*

*A Book of German Lyrics*, selected and edited with Notes and Vocabulary by FRIEDRICH BRUNS, Assistant Professor of German, University of Wisconsin. xi + 194 pp. New York, D. C. Heath & Co., 1921.

The title seems misleading in that a number of narrative poems are included. Thus Schiller is represented by *Die Kraniche des Ibykus* and *Das verschleierte Bild zu Sais*.

The selections comprise the work of fourteen poets, reaching from Goethe to Liliencron. Considering the limitations imposed, there can, on the whole, be no quarrel with the choice of authors: one is even inclined to concede the inclusion of Rückert in this small, select group on the basis of his 'Aus der Jugendzeit, aus der Jugendzeit,' dangerous as such a principle of a single outstanding poem might otherwise prove.

As to emphasis, judged by the space allowed them, these writers fall into three groups, the first being made up of Goethe, Heine, Schiller, and Uhland; the last of Platen, Keller, and Rückert. The balance is just, except possibly in the case of Keller, whose fifty-two lines hardly do him justice, as to either quantity or quality, or bear out the remark of the Preface that "Geibel, Wilhelm